

## SCHOOL & COLLEGE LEGAL SERVICES

## OF CALIFORNIA

A Joint Powers Authority serving school and college districts throughout the state

5350 Skylane Boulevard Santa Rosa, CA 95403

Tel: (707) 524-2690 Fax: (707) 578-0517 santarosa@sclscal.org www.sclscal.org

General Counsel Carl D. Corbin

Attorneys
Monica D. Batanero
Jennifer Henry
Sarah Hirschfeld-Sussman
Nancy L. Klein
Damara L. Moore
Jennifer E. Nix
Steven P. Reiner
Kaitlyn A. Schwendeman
Loren W. Soukup
Erin E. Stagg

Of Counsel Robert J. Henry Margaret M. Merchat Patrick C. Wilson Frank Zotter, Jr.

# LEGAL UPDATE

May 20, 2020

**To:** Superintendents, Member School Districts (K-12)

From: Monica D. Batanero, Sr. Assoc. General Counsel

Kaitlyn A. Schwendeman, Schools Legal Counsel

Subject: New Title IX Regulations Effective August 14, 2020

Memo No. 32-2020

The Department of Education on May 6, 2020, issued much-awaited final regulations on how K-12 school districts and college campuses must respond to allegations of sexual harassment. Secretary of Education Betsy DeVos said the final regulations under Title IX — which prohibits sex discrimination in federally funded educational institutions — were issued after considering various stakeholder comments and as many as 124,000 public comments made since the proposed guidelines were issued in November 2018.

The overall intent of the new Title IX regulations is to provide students accused of sexual misconduct with stronger due process protections. As a result, there are many additional requirements that include very specific grievance and investigation procedures that must be adopted by educational institutions.

The new regulations are scheduled to take effect August 14, 2020, and will require modification of current sexual harassment policies, including investigation procedures.

This office is offering a webinar, entitled "New Title IX Regulations for 2020-2021," on June 3, 2020, from 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. where we will cover in more detail the new requirements under Title IX. You may register here: **DETAILS/REGISTER**.<sup>1</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://sclscal.org/workshop/new-title-ix-regulations-for-2020-2021-k-12-ccd/

Some of the more notable changes are detailed below:

#### **NEW TERMINOLOGY**

The regulations define the following terms to ensure consistency and clarity:

- *Complainant* means an individual who is alleged to be the victim of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment.
- **Respondent** means an individual who has been reported to be the perpetrator of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment.
- *Recipient* means elementary and secondary schools, as well as postsecondary institutions, that receive Federal financial assistance.

## **DEFINITION OF SEXUAL HARASSMENT<sup>2</sup>**

The new regulations provide that there are only three categories of conduct that could constitute sexual harassment under Title IX:

- (1) unwelcome conduct on the basis of sex that a reasonable person would determine is so "severe, pervasive and objectively offensive" that it effectively denies a person equal access to the recipient's education program or activity;
- (2) quid pro quo harassment;<sup>3</sup> or
- (3) sexual assault,<sup>4</sup> dating violence,<sup>5</sup> domestic violence,<sup>6</sup> or stalking<sup>7</sup> as defined in the Clery Act/Violence Against Women Act ("VAWA").

What this means: The final regulations continue the 1997 Guidance and 2001 Guidance approach of including as sexual harassment unwelcome sexual advances, requests for sexual favors, and other verbal, nonverbal, or physical conduct of a sexual nature by an employee, by another student, or by a third party. However, when determining whether conduct meets the definition of sexual harassment, particularly under category 1 (hostile environment), the conduct must be severe, pervasive and objectively offensive. Previously, the legal standard was that the conduct has to be either severe or pervasive. This will result in a huge shift in how we analyze whether sexual conduct creates a hostile environment for a complainant and will make it more difficult for a complainant to argue that he/she has been subjected to a hostile environment due to sexual harassment. Notably, under the new regulations a single instance of harassment on the basis of sex can no longer be considered sexual harassment pursuant to the hostile environment analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 34 CFR § 106.30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Quid pro quo sexual harassment is defined as "an employee of the recipient conditioning the provision of an aid, benefit, or service of the recipient on an individual's participation in unwelcome sexual conduct."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> 20 U.S.C. § 1092(f)(6)(A)(v)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> 34 U.S.C. § 12291(a)(10)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> 34 U.S.C. § 12291(a)(8)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> 34 U.S.C. § 12291(a)(30)

It is important to note that conduct that falls under the other two categories – quid pro quo and Clery Act/VAWA offenses - do not have to meet the elements of "severe, pervasiveness, and objective offensiveness" such that a single instance of sufficiently severe harassment on the basis of sex may have the systemic effect of denying the victim equal access to an education program or activity.

Lastly, recipients may continue to address harassing conduct that does not meet the Title IX definition of sexual harassment under other provisions of the recipient's own code of conduct.

#### **DESIGNATION OF A TITLE IX COORDINATOR**<sup>8</sup>

The Department of Education ("DOE") has clarified that each recipient must designate *and* authorize at least one employee to coordinate its efforts with its responsibilities under Title IX. The employee must be referred to as the "Title IX Coordinator" and the recipient must notify applicants for admission and employment, students, parents or legal guardians of elementary and secondary school students, employees, and all unions or professional organizations holding collective bargaining or professional agreements with the recipient, of the name and title, office address, electronic mail address, and telephone number of the employee designated as the Title IX Coordinator.

<u>What this means</u>: The DOE has expanded the groups of individuals/organizations that must be notified of the Title IX Coordinator's information. The recipient must prominently display on its website, if any, of the Title IX Coordinator's contact information and the recipient's sexual harassment prevention policy and in each handbook catalog that it makes available to the individuals who now must be notified of the Title IX Coordinator's information. In addition, the contact information of the Title IX Coordinator must now include either the name or title of the individual and the email address (which was not required previously).

Most importantly, the regulations clarify the independent compliance and investigatory responsibilities of the Title IX Coordinator. Title IX Coordinators must be given independent authority to monitor and implement a recipient's compliance under Title IX. The Title IX Coordinator must be free from conflicts of interest and bias, and must be trained on, among other things, how to serve impartially.<sup>9</sup>

#### GENERAL RESPONSE TO SEXUAL HARASSMENT<sup>10</sup>

A recipient with *actual knowledge* of sexual harassment in an *education program or activity* of the recipient must respond promptly in a manner that is not deliberately indifferent. A recipient is deliberately indifferent only if its response to sexual harassment is clearly unreasonable in light of the known circumstances.

<sup>8 34</sup> CFR § 106.8

<sup>9 34</sup> CFR § 106.45(b)(1)(iii)

<sup>10 34</sup> CFR § 106.44

- → Actual knowledge means notice of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment to a recipient's Title IX Coordinator or any official of the recipient who has authority to institute corrective measures on behalf of the recipient, or to any employee of an elementary and secondary school.
- → *Notice* results whenever <u>any</u> elementary and secondary school employee, any Title IX Coordinator, or any official with authority: witnesses sexual harassment; hears about sexual harassment or sexual harassment allegations from a complainant (i.e., a person alleged to be the victim) or a third party (e.g., the complainant's parent, friend, or peer); receives a written or verbal complaint about sexual harassment or sexual harassment allegations; or by any other means.
- → Education program or activity includes locations, events, or circumstances over which the recipient exercised substantial control over both the respondent and the context in which the sexual harassment occurs, and also includes any building owned or controlled by a student organization that is officially recognized by a postsecondary institution, e.g., off-campus housing, fraternity/sorority houses, etc.

These final regulations emphasize that any person may trigger a recipient's <u>response obligations</u> by reporting sexual harassment to the Title IX Coordinator using contact information that the recipient must post on the recipient's website. The person who reports does not need to be the complainant (i.e., the person alleged to be the victim); a report may be made by "any person" who believes that sexual harassment may have occurred and requires a recipient's response.

A recipient's response must treat complainants and respondents equitably by offering *supportive measures* to a complainant, and by following a grievance process now required under the new Title IX regulations before the imposition of any disciplinary sanctions or other actions that are not supportive measures, against a respondent.<sup>11</sup> The Title IX Coordinator must promptly contact the complainant to discuss the availability of supportive measures, consider the complainant's wishes with respect to supportive measures, inform the complainant of the availability of supportive measures with or without the filing of a formal complaint, and explain to the complainant the process for filing a formal complaint.

- → Supportive measures 12 means non-disciplinary, non-punitive individualized services offered as appropriate, as reasonably available, and without fee or charge to the complainant or respondent before or after the filing of a formal complaint or where no formal complaint has been filed. Such measures are designed to restore or preserve equal access to the recipient's education program or activity without unreasonably burdening the other party, including measures designed to protect the safety of all parties or the recipient's educational environment or deter sexual harassment.
- → Supportive measures may include counseling, extensions of deadlines or other courserelated adjustments, modifications of work or class schedules, campus escort services, mutual restrictions on contact between the parties, changes in work or housing locations,

4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> 34 CFR § 106.44(a)

<sup>12 34</sup> CFR § 106.30

leaves of absence, increased security and monitoring of certain areas of the campus, and other similar measures. The recipient must maintain as confidential any supportive measures provided to the complainant or respondent, to the extent that maintaining such confidentiality would not impair the ability of the recipient to provide the supportive measures.

The Title IX Coordinator is responsible for coordinating the effective implementation of supportive measures. <sup>13</sup>

With or without a formal complaint, a recipient must comply with the requirement to offer supportive services. 14

<u>What this means</u>: Previously, a recipient's duty to investigate and remediate sexual misconduct was triggered when a "responsible employee" knew or should have known about the sexual harassment/sex discrimination. Not only do the new regulations no longer use the term "responsible employee," the regulations also eliminated the concept of constructive notice (aka "should have known").

For <u>post-secondary educational institutions</u>, notice of sexual harassment/sex discrimination only occurs when that institution's Title IX Coordinator <u>or</u> any official who has authority to institute corrective measures on behalf of the recipient receives notice of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment. Notice includes, but is not limited to, a report of sexual harassment to the Title IX Coordinator and the filing of a formal complaint.

For <u>K-12</u> educational institutions, when *any* employee receives notice from a student or employee of sexual harassment or allegations of sexual harassment, the recipient is deemed to have actual knowledge, thereby triggering the recipient's duty to promptly respond. So, all K-12 employees are considered officials with authority to institute corrective measures and schools may not exempt any classification of employee, such as counselors or classified employees.

The new regulations also eliminated the previously-used term "interim measures" and instead use the term "supportive services."

## **JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES** 15

Sexual harassment that occurs off campus and does not occur in an *education program or activity* of the recipient (as defined above) will not be covered under Title IX. Therefore, sexual harassment that occurs off campus via social media that targets a student, for example, may not fall under the provision of Title IX. However, this type of misconduct may still be in violation of the recipient's code of conduct and so the recipient's response would be pursuant to that policy.

<sup>13 34</sup> CFR § 106.30

<sup>14 34</sup> CFR § 106.45

<sup>15 34</sup> CFR § 106.44(a)

In addition, Title IX no longer applies for acts committed outside the United States even if the misconduct occurred in a recipient's education program or activity, e.g., study abroad program. However, other policies may apply, e.g., a code of conduct policy, that would require a response from the recipient.

<u>What this means</u>: Recipients must be careful to first identify if they have jurisdiction over sexual misconduct in order to determine if Title IX applies. However, even if a recipient does not have jurisdiction under Title IX, it may have jurisdiction under another policy or provision. For example, for K-12 school districts, bullying via social media that occurs off campus may be within a recipient's jurisdiction and subject the offending student to discipline. However, that same conduct may not require a recipient to investigate under Title IX.

#### FORMAL COMPLAINT<sup>17</sup>

A formal complaint means a document filed by a complainant or signed by the Title IX Coordinator alleging sexual harassment against a respondent and requesting that the recipient investigate the allegation of sexual harassment. At the time of filing a formal complaint, a complainant must be participating in or attempting to participate in the education program or activity of the recipient with which the formal complaint is filed. A formal complaint may be filed with the Title IX Coordinator in person, by mail, or by electronic mail.

What this means: The definition of "formal complaint" precludes a third party from filing a formal complaint, which is defined as a document that must be filed by a complainant or signed by the Title IX Coordinator. However, as mentioned earlier, any person who believes that sexual harassment may have occurred may report sexual harassment which would then trigger a recipient's responsibility to determine if supportive services are necessary under the circumstances. Furthermore, a complainant may not submit a formal complaint anonymously, as it requires their physical or digital signature. While a Title IX Coordinator may sign a formal complaint based upon an anonymous report, the identity of the complainant will be disclosed if known.

## **NOTICE OF ALLEGATIONS** 18

Upon receipt of a formal complaint, a recipient must provide the following information through written notice to the parties who are known:

- 1. Notice of the recipient's grievance process that complies with this section, including any informal resolution process.
- 2. Notice of the allegations of sexual harassment potentially constituting sexual harassment, including sufficient details known at the time and with sufficient time to prepare a response before any initial interview. Sufficient details include the identities of the

<sup>16 34</sup> CFR § 106.8(d)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> 34 CFR § 106.30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(2)



parties involved in the incident, if known, the conduct allegedly constituting sexual harassment, and the date and location of the alleged incident, if known.

The written notice must include a statement that the respondent is presumed not responsible for the alleged conduct and that a determination regarding responsibility is made at the conclusion of the grievance process. The written notice must inform the parties that they may have an advisor of their choice, who may be, but is not required to be, an attorney, and may inspect and review evidence obtained during the investigation.

The written notice must inform the parties of any provision in the recipient's code of conduct that prohibits knowingly making false statements or knowingly submitting false information during the grievance process.

If, in the course of an investigation, the recipient decides to investigate allegations about the complainant or respondent that are not included in the notice, the recipient must provide notice of the additional allegations to the parties whose identities are known.

<u>What this means</u>: The intent of the new Title IX regulations is to provide an equitable process that affords due process to the parties involved, particularly the respondent. Providing respondents with specific details about the allegations provides them a better opportunity to defend themselves, which is central to due process.

## RESPONSE TO A FORMAL COMPLAINT<sup>19</sup>

In response to a formal complaint, a recipient must adopt and follow a grievance process that complies with the following elements:

- 1. Treat complainants and respondents equitably by providing remedies to a complainant where a determination of responsibility for sexual harassment has been made against the respondent, and by following a grievance process that complies with this section before the imposition of any disciplinary sanctions or other actions that are not supportive measures as defined in § 106.30, against a respondent. Remedies must be designed to restore or preserve equal access to the recipient's education program or activity. Such remedies may include the same individualized services described in § 106.30 as "supportive measures"; however, remedies need not be non-disciplinary or non-punitive and need not avoid burdening the respondent;
- 2. Require an objective evaluation of all relevant evidence including both inculpatory and exculpatory evidence and provide that credibility determinations may not be based on a person's status as a complainant, respondent, or witness;
- 3. Require that any individual designated by a recipient as a Title IX Coordinator, investigator, decision-maker, or any person designated by a recipient to facilitate an informal resolution process, not have a conflict of interest or bias for or against complainants or respondents generally or an individual complainant or respondent.

\_

<sup>19 34</sup> CFR § 106.45(b)(1)



A recipient must ensure that Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and any person who facilitates an informal resolution process, receive training on the definition of sexual harassment in § 106.30, the scope of the recipient's education program or activity, how to conduct an investigation and grievance process including hearings, appeals, and informal resolution processes, as applicable, and how to serve impartially, including by avoiding prejudgment of the facts at issue, conflicts of interest, and bias. A recipient must ensure that decision-makers receive training on any technology to be used at a live hearing and on issues of relevance of questions and evidence, including when questions and evidence about the complainant's sexual predisposition or prior sexual behavior are not relevant. A recipient also must ensure that investigators receive training on issues of relevance to create an investigative report that fairly summarizes relevant evidence. Any materials used to train Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and any person who facilitates an informal resolution process, must not rely on sex stereotypes and must promote impartial investigations and adjudications of formal complaints of sexual harassment;

- 4. Include a presumption that the respondent is not responsible for the alleged conduct until a determination regarding responsibility is made at the conclusion of the grievance process;
- 5. Include reasonably prompt time frames for conclusion of the grievance process, including reasonably prompt time frames for filing and resolving appeals and informal resolution processes if the recipient offers informal resolution processes, and a process that allows for the temporary delay of the grievance process or the limited extension of time frames for good cause with written notice to the complainant and the respondent of the delay or extension and the reasons for the action. Good cause may include considerations such as the absence of a party, a party's advisor, or a witness; concurrent law enforcement activity; or the need for language assistance or accommodation of disabilities;
- 6. Describe the range of possible disciplinary sanctions and remedies or list the possible disciplinary sanctions and remedies that the recipient may implement following any determination of responsibility;
- 7. State whether the standard of evidence to be used to determine responsibility is the preponderance of the evidence standard or the clear and convincing evidence standard, apply the same standard of evidence for formal complaints against students as for formal complaints against employees, including faculty, and apply the same standard of evidence to all formal complaints of sexual harassment;
- 8. Include the procedures and permissible bases for the complainant and respondent to appeal;
- 9. Describe the range of supportive measures available to complainants and respondents; and



10. Not require, allow, rely upon, or otherwise use questions or evidence that constitute, or seek disclosure of, information protected under a legally recognized privilege, unless the person holding such privilege has waived the privilege.

What this means: The two most notable changes are the never before required training requirements for Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and any person who facilitates an informal resolution process and the requirement that recipients apply the same standard of evidence for formal complaints against students as for formal complaints against employees, including faculty. For example, if a collective bargaining agreement requires a clear and convincing standard for formal complaints against employees, then that same standard would have to be applied for formal complaints against students. The two standards of evidence that a recipient must choose from are preponderance of the evidence (more likely than not or >50%) or clear and convincing evidence (substantially more likely than not or ~75%).

Regarding the new training requirements for Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and any person who facilitates an informal resolution process, there is no minimum hourly training requirement, but instead the training must include the following components: the definition of sexual harassment, the scope of the recipient's education program or activity, how to conduct an investigation and grievance process including hearings, appeals, and informal resolution processes, as applicable, and how to serve impartially, including by avoiding prejudgment of the facts at issue, conflicts of interest, and bias. Decision-makers specifically must receive training on any technology to be used at a live hearing and on issues of relevance of questions and evidence, including when questions and evidence about the complainant's sexual predisposition or prior sexual behavior are not relevant. A recipient also must ensure that investigators receive training on issues of relevance to create an investigative report that fairly summarizes relevant evidence.

#### DISMISSAL OF A FORMAL COMPLAINT<sup>20</sup>

The recipient must investigate the allegations in a formal complaint. If the conduct alleged in the formal complaint would not constitute sexual harassment as defined in § 106.30 even if proved, did not occur in the recipient's education program or activity, or did not occur against a person in the United States, then the recipient must dismiss the formal complaint with regard to that conduct for purposes of sexual harassment under Title IX or this part; such a dismissal does not preclude action under another provision of the recipient's code of conduct.

The recipient may dismiss the formal complaint or any allegations therein, if at any time during the investigation or hearing: a complainant notifies the Title IX Coordinator in writing that the complainant would like to withdraw the formal complaint or any allegations therein; the respondent is no longer enrolled or employed by the recipient; or specific circumstances prevent the recipient from gathering evidence sufficient to reach a determination as to the formal complaint or allegations therein. Upon dismissal of a formal complaint, the recipient must promptly send written notice of the dismissal and reason(s) therefore simultaneously to the parties.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(3)

<u>What this means</u>: The Title IX regulations now specify when a recipient <u>must</u> dismiss a complaint under Title IX. In addition, a complainant can request to dismiss a formal complaint, but the recipient is not required to dismiss the complaint.

#### EMERGENCY REMOVAL<sup>21</sup>

Nothing in this part precludes a recipient from removing a respondent from the recipient's education program or activity on an emergency basis, provided that the recipient undertakes an individualized safety and risk analysis, determines that an immediate threat to the physical health or safety of any student or other individual arising from the allegations of sexual harassment justifies removal, and provides the respondent with notice and an opportunity to challenge the decision immediately following the removal. This provision may not be construed to modify any rights under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, or the Americans with Disabilities Act.

What this means: A recipient may only remove a respondent from his/her education program or activity after considering several criteria in order to determine if the respondent must be removed to ensure the physical health or safety of any student. In addition, a respondent is entitled to some form of due process immediately following his/her removal from his/her education program or activity. This "due process" may be a hearing or meeting with an administrator responsible for conducting the individualized safety and risk analysis for the sole purpose of providing the respondent the opportunity to challenge the decision.

## INVESTIGATION OF A FORMAL COMPLAINT<sup>22</sup>

When investigating a formal complaint and throughout the grievance process, a recipient must—

- 1. Ensure that the burden of proof and the burden of gathering evidence sufficient to reach a determination regarding responsibility rests on the recipient and not on the parties. Furthermore, the recipient cannot access, consider, disclose, or otherwise use a party's records that are made or maintained by a physician, psychiatrist, psychologist, or other recognized professional or paraprofessional acting in the professional's or paraprofessional's capacity, or assisting in that capacity, and which are made and maintained in connection with the provision of treatment to the party, unless the recipient obtains that party's voluntary, written consent to do so for a grievance process under this section (if a party is not an "eligible student," as defined in 34 CFR § 99.3, then the recipient must obtain the voluntary, written consent of a "parent," as defined in 34 CFR § 99.3);
- 2. Provide an equal opportunity for the parties to present witnesses, including fact and expert witnesses, and other inculpatory and exculpatory evidence;
- 3. Not restrict the ability of either party to discuss the allegations under investigation or to gather and present relevant evidence;

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> 34 CFR § 106.44(c)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(5)

- 4. Provide the parties with the same opportunities to have others present during any grievance proceeding, including the opportunity to be accompanied to any related meeting or proceeding by the advisor of their choice, who may be, but is not required to be, an attorney, and not limit the choice or presence of advisor for either the complainant or respondent in any meeting or grievance proceeding; however, the recipient may establish restrictions regarding the extent to which the advisor may participate in the proceedings, as long as the restrictions apply equally to both parties;
- 5. Provide, to a party whose participation is invited or expected, written notice of the date, time, location, participants, and purpose of all hearings, investigative interviews, or other meetings, with sufficient time for the party to prepare to participate;
- 6. Provide both parties an equal opportunity to inspect and review any evidence obtained as part of the investigation that is directly related to the allegations raised in a formal complaint, including the evidence upon which the recipient does not intend to rely in reaching a determination regarding responsibility and inculpatory or exculpatory evidence whether obtained from a party or other source, so that each party can meaningfully respond to the evidence prior to conclusion of the investigation. Prior to completion of the investigative report, the recipient must send to each party and the party's advisor, if any, the evidence subject to inspection and review in an electronic format or a hard copy, and the parties must have at least 10 days to submit a written response, which the investigator will consider prior to completion of the investigative report. The recipient must make all such evidence subject to the parties' inspection and review available at any hearing to give each party equal opportunity to refer to such evidence during the hearing, including for purposes of cross-examination; and
- 7. Create an investigative report that fairly summarizes relevant evidence and, at least 10 days prior to a hearing (if a hearing is required or otherwise provided) or other time of determination regarding responsibility, send to each party and the party's advisor, if any, the investigative report in an electronic format or a hard copy, for their review and written response.

<u>What this means</u>: The investigation procedure that recipients must now adopt must be followed in order to provide the parties, particularly the respondent, with due process. The regulations make clear that it is the recipient's responsibility, not the parties', to gather evidence sufficient to reach a determination regarding responsibility and the burden of proof rests with the recipient.

Each party is now entitled to review, prior to the completion of the investigation report, all evidence, inculpatory and exculpatory, that is directly related to the allegations raised in the formal complaint. Practically speaking, this will be accomplished by the investigator providing a copy of the draft investigation report prior to the completion of the report and allow each party at least 10 days to submit a written response, which the investigator will consider prior to completion of the investigative report.

## **HEARINGS**<sup>23</sup>

For <u>postsecondary institutions</u>, the recipient's grievance process must provide for a live hearing. At the live hearing, the decision-maker(s) must permit each party's advisor to ask the other party and any witnesses all relevant questions and follow-up questions, including those challenging credibility.

Such cross-examination at the live hearing must be conducted directly, orally, and in real time by the party's advisor of choice and never by a party personally, notwithstanding the discretion of the recipient to otherwise restrict the extent to which advisors may participate in the proceedings. At the request of either party, the recipient must provide for the live hearing to occur with the parties located in separate rooms with technology enabling the decision-maker(s) and parties to simultaneously see and hear the party or the witness answering questions.

Only relevant cross-examination and other questions may be asked of a party or witness. Before a complainant, respondent, or witness answers a cross-examination or other question, the decision-maker(s) must first determine whether the question is relevant and explain any decision to exclude a question as not relevant.

If a party does not have an advisor present at the live hearing, the recipient must provide without fee or charge to that party, an advisor of the recipient's choice, who may be, but is not required to be, an attorney, to conduct cross-examination on behalf of that party.

Questions and evidence about the complainant's sexual predisposition or prior sexual behavior are not relevant, unless such questions and evidence about the complainant's prior sexual behavior are offered to prove that someone other than the respondent committed the conduct alleged by the complainant, or if the questions and evidence concern specific incidents of the complainant's prior sexual behavior with respect to the respondent and are offered to prove consent.

If a party or witness does not submit to cross-examination at the live hearing, the decision-maker(s) must not rely on any statement of that party or witness in reaching a determination regarding responsibility; provided, however, that the decision-maker(s) cannot draw an inference about the determination regarding responsibility based solely on a party's or witness's absence from the live hearing or refusal to answer cross-examination or other questions. Live hearings pursuant to this paragraph may be conducted with all parties physically present in the same geographic location or, at the recipient's discretion, any or all parties, witnesses, and other participants may appear at the live hearing virtually, with technology enabling participants simultaneously to see and hear each other.

Recipients must create an audio or audiovisual recording, or transcript, of any live hearing and make it available to the parties for inspection and review.

For <u>recipients that are elementary and secondary schools</u>, and other recipients that are not postsecondary institutions, the recipient's grievance process may, but need not, provide for a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(6)(i)

hearing. With or without a hearing, after the recipient has sent the investigative report to the parties and before reaching a determination regarding responsibility, the decision-maker(s) must afford each party the opportunity to submit written, relevant questions that a party wants asked of any party or witness, provide each party with the answers, and allow for additional, limited follow-up questions from each party.

With or without a hearing, questions and evidence about the complainant's sexual predisposition or prior sexual behavior are not relevant, unless such questions and evidence about the complainant's prior sexual behavior are offered to prove that someone other than the respondent committed the conduct alleged by the complainant, or if the questions and evidence concern specific incidents of the complainant's prior sexual behavior with respect to the respondent and are offered to prove consent. The decision-maker(s) must explain to the party proposing the questions any decision to exclude a question as not relevant.

<u>What this means</u>: Postsecondary institutions are now required to conduct a live hearing conducted by a neutral decision-maker (hearing officer or panel) who will review the evidence and make a decision as to culpability. The decision-maker cannot be the Title IX Coordinator or the investigator. The hearing can be conducted via video conference and it must always be recorded. The parties must be allowed to ask relevant questions and cross-examine witnesses.

If a party does not have an advisor present at a live hearing, the recipient must provide an advisor of the recipient's choice to conduct cross-examination on behalf of that party. A party cannot conduct questioning on their own behalf. Therefore, if a party does not have an advisor, the recipient will need to provide one, which can be an employee of the recipient; however, the recipient chooses the advisor.

Recipients that are elementary and secondary schools are not required to conduct live hearings to determine culpability. However, the parties must be given the opportunity to submit written, relevant questions they wanted asked of any party or witness after receiving the investigation report. The recipient will then provide each party with the answers to their questions and then allow for additional, limited follow-up questions from each party.

#### STANDARD OF EVIDENCE<sup>24</sup>

The final regulations were revised to clearly require a recipient's grievance process to state up front which of the two permissible standards of evidence the recipient has selected and then to apply that selected standard to all formal complaints of sexual harassment, including those against employees.

## **DETERMINATION REGARDING RESPONSIBILITY**<sup>25</sup>

The decision-maker(s), who cannot be the same person(s) as the Title IX Coordinator or the investigator(s), must issue a written determination regarding responsibility. To reach this determination, the recipient must apply the standard of evidence that it applies to all formal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(1)(vii)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(7)

complaints of sexual harassment – either preponderance of the evidence or clear and convincing evidence.

The written determination must include the following elements:

- 1. Identification of the allegations potentially constituting sexual harassment;
- A description of the procedural steps taken from the receipt of the formal complaint through the determination, including any notifications to the parties, interviews with parties and witnesses, site visits, methods used to gather other evidence, and hearings held;
- 3. Findings of fact supporting the determination;
- 4. Conclusions regarding the application of the recipient's code of conduct to the facts;
- 5. A statement of, and rationale for, the result as to each allegation, including a determination regarding responsibility, any disciplinary sanctions the recipient imposes on the respondent, and whether remedies designed to restore or preserve equal access to the recipient's education program or activity will be provided by the recipient to the complainant; and
- 6. The recipient's procedures and permissible bases for the complainant and respondent to appeal.

The recipient must provide the written determination to the parties simultaneously. The determination regarding responsibility becomes final either on the date that the recipient provides the parties with the written determination of the result of the appeal, if an appeal is filed, or if an appeal is not filed, the date on which an appeal would no longer be considered timely.

The Title IX Coordinator is responsible for effective implementation of any remedies. <sup>26</sup>

<u>What this means</u>: A recipient must now ensure that an individual, other than the Title IX Coordinator or investigator, reviews all the evidence and makes a determination regarding a respondent's responsibility under Title IX. In small elementary and secondary districts, this will require that the Title IX Coordinator be an employee other than the chief administrative officer.

## APPEALS<sup>27</sup>

A recipient must offer both parties an appeal from a determination regarding responsibility, and from a recipient's dismissal of a formal complaint or any allegations therein, on the following bases:

1. Procedural irregularity that affected the outcome of the matter;

14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(7)(iv)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(8)

- 2. New evidence that was not reasonably available at the time the determination regarding responsibility or dismissal was made, that could affect the outcome of the matter; and
- 3. The Title IX Coordinator, investigator(s), or decision-maker(s) had a conflict of interest or bias for or against complainants or respondents generally or the individual complainant or respondent that affected the outcome of the matter.

A recipient may offer an appeal equally to both parties on additional bases. As to all appeals, the recipient must:

- 1. Notify the other party in writing when an appeal is filed and implement appeal procedures equally for both parties;
- 2. Ensure that the decision-maker(s) for the appeal is not the same person as the decision-maker(s) that reached the determination regarding responsibility or dismissal, the investigator(s), or the Title IX Coordinator;
- 3. Ensure that the decision-maker(s) for the appeal is unbiased and meets the training requirements under Title IX;
- 4. Give both parties a reasonable, equal opportunity to submit a written statement in support of, or challenging, the outcome;
- 5. Issue a written decision describing the result of the appeal and the rationale for the result; and
- 6. Provide the written decision simultaneously to both parties.

<u>What this means</u>: Both parties must now be offered the opportunity to appeal a determination regarding responsibility. Previously, recipients generally only provided the complainant with an opportunity to appeal a determination regarding responsibility. Also, the decision-maker for the appeal must meet the same training requirement as the Title IX Coordinator.

## INFORMAL RESOLUTION<sup>28</sup>

A recipient may not require as a condition of enrollment or continuing enrollment, or employment or continuing employment, or enjoyment of any other right, waiver of the right to an investigation and adjudication of formal complaints of sexual harassment consistent with this section. Similarly, a recipient may not require the parties to participate in an informal resolution process under this section and may not offer an informal resolution process unless a formal complaint is filed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(9)



However, at any time prior to reaching a determination regarding responsibility the recipient may facilitate an informal resolution process, such as mediation, that does not involve a full investigation and adjudication, provided that the recipient –

- 1. Provides to the parties a written notice disclosing: the allegations, the requirements of the informal resolution process including the circumstances under which it precludes the parties from resuming a formal complaint arising from the same allegations, provided, however, that at any time prior to agreeing to a resolution, any party has the right to withdraw from the informal resolution process and resume the grievance process with respect to the formal complaint, and any consequences resulting from participating in the informal resolution process, including the records that will be maintained or could be shared;
- 2. Obtains the parties' voluntary, written consent to the informal resolution process; and
- 3. Does not offer or facilitate an informal resolution process to resolve allegations that an employee sexually harassed a student.

<u>What this means</u>: Recipients are not required to develop and implement an informal resolution process. However, if a recipient chooses to develop an informal resolution process, it cannot be offered unless a formal complaint has been filed.

### RECORDKEEPING<sup>29</sup>

A recipient must maintain for a period of seven (7) years records of –

- Each sexual harassment investigation including any determination regarding
  responsibility and any audio or audiovisual recording or transcript required under Title
  IX, any disciplinary sanctions imposed on the respondent, and any remedies provided to
  the complainant designed to restore or preserve equal access to the recipient's education
  program or activity;
- 2. Any appeal and the result therefrom;
- 3. Any informal resolution and the result therefrom; and
- 4. All materials used to train Title IX Coordinators, investigators, decision-makers, and any person who facilitates an informal resolution process. A recipient must make these training materials publicly available on its website, or if the recipient does not maintain a website, the recipient must make these materials available upon request for inspection by members of the public.

<u>What this means</u>: Recipients must now maintain records regarding every phase of a sexual harassment investigation under Title IX for at least seven years. Previously, there was no express requirement on maintaining records for a specific period of time.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(10)

## TRAINING MATERIALS PUBLICATION REQUIREMENT<sup>30</sup>

Each recipient must publish on its website the training materials used to train its Title IX Coordinator.

<u>What this means</u>: If the training materials are proprietary, and thus copyrighted, we recommend you list the materials by its title, but not make them available on your website. You can further state on your website that the materials may be available for inspection with the Title IX Coordinator.

#### **REMEDIAL ACTION**<sup>31</sup>

The DOE has clarified that it may require a recipient to take remedial action for discriminating in violation of Title IX *and* for violating Title IX regulations.

<u>What this means</u>: A recipient that does not follow the requirements of Title IX, such as not designating an employee as a Title IX Coordinator, failing to offer supportive services, failing to send written notice after dismissing a complainant's allegations, or not following its grievance procedures, may be found to have violated Title IX, even if the violation does not, itself, constitute sex discrimination.

#### <u>RIGHTS OF PARENTS</u><sup>32</sup>

The regulations expressly recognize the legal rights of parents/guardians to act on behalf of a complainant or respondent on any Title IX matter.

What this means: Parents/guardians cannot be prevented from representing their child or acting on their behalf on any Title IX matter. However, once a child attains the age of majority (18), he/she holds his/her educational rights, unless he/she is conserved, and can act on their own behalf. However, an adult child can assign his/her educational rights to his/her parent/guardian so that the parent/guardian can act on their child's behalf.

Please contact our office with questions regarding this Legal Update or any other legal matter.

The information in this Legal Update is provided as a summary of law and is not intended as legal advice. Application of the law may vary depending on the particular facts and circumstances at issue. We, therefore, recommend that you consult legal counsel to advise you on how the law applies to your specific situation.

© 2020 School and College Legal Services of California

All rights reserved. However, SCLS grants permission to any current SCLS client to use, reproduce, and distribute this Legal Update in its entirety for the client's own non-commercial purposes.

<sup>32</sup> 34 CFR § 106.6(g)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> 34 CFR § 106.45(b)(10)(i)(D)

<sup>31 34</sup> CFR § 106.3